

1 HON. RICARDO S. MARTINEZ
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9

10 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
11 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
12 AT SEATTLE

13 JANE DOE,

14 Plaintiff

15 v.

16 LINCOLN NATIONAL LIFE
17 INSURANCE COMPANY,

Defendant.

STIPULATED MOTION FOR LEAVE TO
FILE “ADMINISTRATIVE RECORD”
UNDER SEAL AND [PROPOSED] ORDER

NOTED FOR HEARING: May 24, 2022

18
19 **I. Relief Requested**

20 The parties respectfully move the Court, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure
21 5.2(d) and Local Civil Rule 5(g), to order that the “Administrative Record” in this action – the
22 defendant insurance company’s claim file – be filed under seal, without redactions.
23

24 **II. Relevant Facts and Legal Authority**

25 This action arises under the Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974 (ERISA),
26 29 U.S.C. § 1001 et seq. The parties agree the Court will need to consider Defendant’s claim file
27

STIPULATED MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE RECORD
UNDER SEAL AND [PROPOSED] ORDER - Page 1

No. 2:22-cv-00491-RSM

LAW OFFICE OF MEL CRAWFORD
9425 35th Avenue N.E. Suite C
Seattle, Washington 98115
Tel 206.694-1614 Fax 206.905-2342

to resolve the matter. Such files have come to be called the “Administrative Record” in ERISA benefit cases. Here, that file is primarily medical records and other documents addressing Plaintiff’s medical condition.

Although Local Civil Rule 5(g) establishes a strong presumption in favor of public access to court filings, the need to protect medical privacy qualifies as a “compelling reason” to allow records to be filed under seal. *Karpenski v. Am. Gen. Life Companies, LLC*, No. 2:12-CV-01569-RSM, 2013 WL 5588312 at *1 (W.D. Wash. Oct. 9, 2013) (citing *Kamakana v. City and County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1179 (9th Cir. 2006)). See also *Macon v. United Parcel Serv., Inc.*, No. C12-260 RAJ, 2013 WL 951013, at *5 (W.D. Wash. Mar. 12, 2013) (granting unopposed motion to seal medical records given the “private nature of the documents at issue”); *Gary v. Unum Life Ins. Co. of Am.*, No. 3:17-CV-01414-HZ, 2018 WL 1811470, at *3 (D. Or. Apr. 17, 2018) (“[t]he parties have not presented, and the Court is not aware of, any cases where medical information was not allowed to be filed under seal under the ‘compelling reasons’ standard.”).

Local Civil Rule 5.2(c) states that “in an action for benefits under the Social Security Act” the “administrative record must be filed under seal” because those “actions are entitled to special treatment due to the prevalence of sensitive information and the volume of filings.” *Id.* That reasoning applies to this action. Sensitive information is found throughout the claim file.

As certified below, the parties discussed whether redaction would be a suitable alternative. Due to the volume of the record, and the extensive redaction that would be necessary, the parties believe redaction is not a reasonable alternative. Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5(d) provides that the “court may order that a filing be made under seal without redaction” and the parties respectfully move the Court to so order here.

**STIPULATED MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE RECORD
UNDER SEAL AND [PROPOSED] ORDER - Page 2**

III. Local Rule 5.2(g)(3)(A) Certification

The parties certify pursuant to Local Rule 5.2(g)(3)(A) that attorneys for both parties conferred by telephone on May 23, 2022, to discuss filing the record under seal and to explore redaction and other alternatives to filing under seal. They agreed redaction was not a reasonable means to protect Plaintiff's medical privacy, because the documents would need to be so extensively redacted.

IV. Conclusion

The parties respectfully move the Court to order that the “Administrative Record” in this action be filed under seal, without redaction.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 24th day of May 2022.

LAW OFFICE OF MEL CRAWFORD

By s/Mel Crawford
Mel Crawford, WSBA # 22930
melcrawford@melcrawfordlaw.com
Attorney for Plaintiff

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.

By: *s/Russell S. Buhite*
Russell S. Buhite, WSBA #41257
Russell.Buhite@ogletree.com

By: s/Bensy Benjamin
Bensy Benjamin, WSBA #53842
Bensy.Benjamin@ogletree.com

Attorneys for Defendant Lincoln National Life Insurance Co.

**STIPULATED MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE RECORD
UNDER SEAL AND [PROPOSED] ORDER - Page 3**

No. 2:22-cv-00491-RSM

LAW OFFICE OF MEL CRAWFORD
9425 35th Avenue N.E. Suite C
Seattle, Washington 98115
Tel 206.694-1614 Fax 206.905-2342

ORDER

IT IS SO ORDERED. The Court GRANTS the parties' stipulated motion and ORDERS that the administrative record in this action be filed and maintained under seal. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5(d), the record need not be redacted.

DATED this _____ day of _____ 2022.

Honorable Ricardo S. Martinez
Chief United State District Judge

**STIPULATED MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE RECORD
UNDER SEAL AND [PROPOSED] ORDER - Page 4**

No. 2:22-cv-00491-RSM

LAW OFFICE OF MEL CRAWFORD
9425 35th Avenue N.E. Suite C
Seattle, Washington 98115
Tel 206.694-1614 Fax 206.905-2342

1
2 CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE
3
4

5 I certify that on the date noted below I electronically filed this document using the
6 CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the following persons:
7
8

9
10 Russell S. Buhite
11 Bensy Benjamin
12 Ogletree, Deakins, Nash, Smoak & Stewart, P.C.
13 1201 Third Avenue, Suite 5150
14 Seattle, WA 98101
15 Russell.Buhite@ogletree.com
16 Bensy.Benjamin@ogletree.com
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27

10 DATED this 24th day of May 2022 at Seattle, Washington.
11
12
13 s/Mel Crawford
14 Mel Crawford
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27

STIPULATED MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE RECORD
UNDER SEAL AND [PROPOSED] ORDER - Page 5

No. 2:22-cv-00491-RSM

LAW OFFICE OF MEL CRAWFORD
9425 35th Avenue N.E. Suite C
Seattle, Washington 98115
Tel 206.694-1614 Fax 206.905-2342